

Design Review Board



**Tuesday, February 11, 2020
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM**

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chambers – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Chair Randy Carter
Vice Chair Scott Thomas
Boardmember Sean Banda
Boardmember Nicole Posten-Thompson
Boardmember J. Seth Placko
Boardmember Jeanette Knudsen
Boardmember Tanner Green

Board Members Absent:

Staff Present:

Nana Appiah, Planning Director
Tom Ellsworth, Principal Planner
Lesley Davis, Senior Planner
Heather Omta, Planning Assistant
Lisa Davis, Planner II
Charlotte Bridges, Planner I
Kellie Rorex, Planner I
Ryan McCann, Planner I

Others Present:

Chair Randy Carter welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:31 p.m.

- A. Call to order
- B. Consider the minutes from 1/14/2020 meetings.

Vice Chair Thomas motioned to approve the January 14th meeting minutes, Boardmember Banda seconded the motion.

Vote: 7-0

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Carter–Thomas–Banda–Posten-Thompson–Placko–Knudsen

NAYS – None

C. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases:

This is a preliminary review of Design Review Board cases. The applicant and public may speak about the case, and the Board may provide comments and suggestions to assist the Applicant with the proposal, but the Board will not approve or deny a case under Preliminary Review.

Item C.1. DRB19-00836 Within the 400 block of North Greenfield Road and the 4400 block of East University Drive.

Council District 2. Located on the northeast corner of North Greenfield Road and East University Drive. (1± acres). Requesting the review of a new restaurant with drive-thru and outdoor seating. LC Properties 1 LLC, Applicant; LC Properties 1 LLC, Owner.

Staff Planner: Lisa Davis

Boardmember, Nicole Posten-Thompson, recused herself from the board.

Staff planner, Lisa Davis, presented case DRB19-00836. She explained that the existing site used to be an auto center. Remodeling the site to be a new restaurant with a drive-thru.

Applicant, Daniel Leung, 8710 N Thornydale Rd # 120, Tucson, AZ, represented the case and was available for board questions.

Boardmember Banda

-
- Bases of the columns are too heavy for the building.
- The sign does not have enough visibility and looks too “corporate”.
- Likes the stamped concrete identifying where people could be crossing.

Vice Chair Thomas

- Bases of the columns look a bit oversized.
- Monument sign could use some masonry to tie into the building.

Boardmember Green

- Awning looks nice and compliments the building.
- Ties into the other buildings within the complex yet brings in modern architecture.

- Tone down the chrome, try a polished tone so it won't reflect the light too much.
- Trees might interfere with powerlines.

Boardmember Carter

- Asked why power wasn't undergrounded.
 - Applicant, Daniel Leung, explained the rest of the complex has above ground power and to change would be too costly.

Boardmember Placko

- On the NW corner – 6 mesquite trees could interfere with powerlines. Too many trees in that corner.
- Recommends looking for a tree variety that will fit under powerlines at maturity.
- Feels like monument sign is pushed back and not as visible as it could be.
- NW corner sidewalk seems to dead-end.

Boardmember Knudsen

- Believes the project will fit nicely in the neighborhood.

Summary

1. Reduce column base size.
2. Tie monument sign into building design.
3. Raise the height of the building signs.
4. Stainless to be a matte finish.
5. Revise trees variety to avoid interfering with powerlines.
6. Landscape plan drawn to mature scale.
7. Consider moving the monument sign toward the street.
8. Investigate accessible walk to Greenfield Road.

Item C.2. DRB19-00915 Within the 5000 block of South 71st Street (west side).
Council District 6. Located north of East Ray Road and east of Power Road. (5± acres).
Requesting the review of an industrial development. BCMA Architecture, Applicant; AEI
Arizona OZ Fund LLC, Owner.

Staff Planner: Lisa Davis

Staff planner, Lisa Davis, presented case DRB19-00915.

Applicant, Brian Moore, 322 W Knight Lane, Gilbert, AZ, briefly described project and was available for board questions.

Chair Carter:

- Reconsider the green color on the panels.

Boardmember Banda

- The canopy feels spindly compared to the building.
- Likes the form of the building and the angles.
- Likes the texture on the building.
- Thinks lighting could accent the architectures well, keep under 4000 Kelvin.
- Consider revising the banding on the building.
- Could revise the canopy to add a fun element and beef up the canopy more.

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Bring accent colors into other parts of the façade.
- Agrees the green color is not appealing in person.
- Entryway canopy seems thin.
- Bring in some more white to offset all the grey tones.

Boardmember Knudsen

- Two of the darker grey tones are very similar in tone. Consider selecting a tone with a bit more variation.

Boardmember Placko

- Oak trees drop sap, consider bigger islands and fewer parking spots or reconsider tree species in the parking lot.
- Plants on the northside of the building are not called out on the plan.

Boardmember Green

- Screen wall – Use on style of stone.
- Metal gate – Try to match metals not the green on the building.

Summary

1. Change color green color to darker green tone or another color all together.
2. Change in column size and mass of canopy.
3. Sides and back of building need articulation.
4. Change greys to avoid matching.
5. Change Oak trees.
6. Add Landscape between parking area and south side of the building.

Item C.3. DRB19-00934 Buildings A through D
Within the 1800 to 2000 block South Hobson (east side); the 600 to 800 blocks of East Baseline Road; and the 1900 to 2000 blocks of South Horne block (west side).

Building E

Within the 500 block of East Auto Center Drive (south side); and within the 1700 block of South Hobson (west side).

Council District 3. Located east of Mesa Drive on the north side of Baseline Road. (24± acres). Requesting the review of an industrial development on 2 sites. McCall and Associates Architects, Applicant; Puppyfeathers Limited Partnership, Owner.

Staff Planner: Ryan McCann

Ryan McCann presented the case for an industrial development on two sites.

Applicant, Mike Withey from Withey Morris PLC, 2525 E. Arizona Biltmore Cir, Ste A212, Phoenix, AZ. Mr. Withey explained they previously presented phases one and two of this project and they have been constructed. This is phase three of the Metro East Valley Commerce Center. This phase will keep the overall design theme with some changes to tweak repeated themes.

Boardmember Carter

- Flatness of parapet is a visual challenge.
- The mass between windows and parapet is heavy.
- Bldg. C & D likes the metal pop outs breakup the mass.
- Bldg. A & B feels disproportionate.

Boardmember Knudsen

- Bldg. A, B, C, & D - The warmer color samples provided will read purple and pink in large scale.
- Suggests viewing a very large sample before finalizing color selection.

Boardmember Banda

- Likes the look of the buildings.
- Speaks well to the plaza as a whole.
- Requests an enhanced covered parking detail.

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Likes the metal eyebrows.
- Does not want to see standard canopies for parking.
- Relocate canopies to the side of the building.

Boardmember Green

- Phase I & II are not really seen however feels this phase needs landscaping to soften the look because they are very visible from Horne and Baseline Road.
- Doesn't want to see parking right up next to the street.

Vice Chair Thomas

- Blends well with phase I & II.

Summary:

1. Revise flat parapets to add articulation.
2. Building A & B - break up proportion above windows.
3. Check colors to ensure they are the colors envisioned.
4. Lighting package needs reviewed, recommends 3500K to maintain natural hue.
5. Add Trellis stipes to Building A & B.
6. Live Oaks should be swapped out for a less messy variety of tree.
7. Covered parking along Baseline Road needs to be eliminated, move to the side of the building.

Item C.4. DRB19-00970 Within the 7100 to 7200 blocks of East Baseline Road (south side)
Council District 6. Located east of Power Road on the south side of East Baseline Road.
(1.70± acres). Requesting the review of a new medical and professional office building.
Woods Associates Architects LLC, Applicant; Sardar Khamis George, Owner.

Staff Planner: Kellie Rorex

Staff planner, Kellie Rorex presented case DRB19-00970.

Applicant, Fred Woods, 3125 E Dover Street, Mesa, AZ, represented the case. Mr. Woods explained the project is for a new dermatology center.

Chair Carter

- Nicely designed
- Has 4-sided architecture

Boardmember Banda

- Like the design and all the different elements.
- Has a modern, desert architecture.
- Has a timelessness about it.
- Recommends using accent lighting, stay within the 3500 Kelvin range for a more natural tone of light.

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- East elevation appears to be one parapet across the back.
- The masonry horizontal striping could use some variation in pattern.

Boardmember Knudsen

- Asked where the blue color sample will be on the building?
 - Applicant, Fred Woods, confirmed the frame of the canopy will be blue.
- Doesn't care for the bright blue paired with the red brick.
- Suggests selecting a different hue of blue.

Boardmember Green

- Appreciates the attention to detail in the building.

Boardmember Placko

- Tree by trash enclosure will need to be removed from the plan.
- 430 shrubs will require a lot of landscape upkeep.
- Recommends diversifying the plant palette.

Summary:

1. Create connectivity with Tuscan landscape.

2. Powder-coat the awnings and metals, not just paint.
3. Consider parapet undulation on east elevation.
4. Consider revising brick striping pattern.
5. Consider another hue of blue.
6. Blend landscaping with varying species.

D. Discuss and take action on the following Design Review case:

Item D.1. DRB19-00845 Within the 100 block of South 63rd Street (east side) and within the 100 block of South 64th Street (west side).

Council District 2. Located south of Main Street and east of Recker Road. (4.5± acres). Request for review of a new medical office building and clinic. Also consider a request for a building height exception. Tamimi Architects, Applicant; LMAD Development LLC, Owner.

Staff Planner: Charlotte Bridges

Staff planner, Charlotte Bridges presented case. She described the project and noted that the project will be constructed in two phases and the height of lobby elevation is 34.5 feet. She explained that the board will need to vote on the height exception for the building and make recommendations for the architecture.

Applicant, Marwan Tamimi, 4501 E Gold Poppy Way, Phoenix, AZ, represented the project and was available for Board questions.

Boardmember Green

- Asked for clarification that the approval for the height acceptance is for both phases.
 - Charlotte Bridges confirmed this approval is for both phases of the project.

Boardmember Banda

- Likes the mixed stone.
- Reduce amount of the stucco on the east elevation.
- Change window shape and mullion pattern to a vertical design.
- Lighting – with browns need 3500 Kelvins rather than 4000K.
- Doesn't care for section cut & stucco look.
- Provide articulation on the north elevation of the Phase I building.

Posten-Thompson

- Recommends backlighting architectural features of the buildings.
- Grid pattern windows look a bit institutional.
- Provide planters or pots at the entrance plaza.
- Integrate architectural elements in the parking canopy structures.

Boardmember Knudsen

- All grey tones go well, consider changing the "Teddy Bear" to a cool tone or hue

Boardmember Placko

- Palo Blanco trees along the north elevation of the Phase II building should be in groups of three or replaced by a more suitable tree species for that spacing.
- Use a hybrid mesquite tree variety in the parking lot islands or change to a different tree species. Current Mesquite species on landscape plan has a weak root base that is easily uprooted during storms when fully mature.

Chair Carter

- Breakup the vertical lines of the east elevation by incorporating more horizontal design elements similar to the techniques used on the west elevation.
- Porte cochere is too understated for the elevation. Redesign the porte cochere to give it a stronger identity on the west elevation.
- Verify that the porte cochere column is surrounded by a raised planter to protect the base from vehicles.

Summary:

1. Revise the North Elevation's window shape and mullion design to avoid an institutional look.
2. Break-up the vertical lines of the east elevation by incorporating more horizontal design elements similar to the techniques used on the west elevation.
3. Change out the warm brown color to a cooler tone or hue.
4. Install Palo Blanco trees in groups of three along the North Elevation or substitute a different tree species suitable for individual planting.
5. Plant a hybrid Mesquite tree species in the parking lot islands or substitute a different tree species.
6. Redesign the porte cochere to give it a stronger identity on the west elevation.
7. Add a raised planter around at the base of the porte cochere canopy column.
8. Provide accent lighting and reduce the light temperature to 3500K or less. Integrate architectural elements into parking canopy structures.
9. Finish the "knock-out" panel at the north elevation of the Phase I building to match adjacent stucco walls with horizontal scoring detail.

Boardmember Posten-Thompson motioned to approve the height exceptions with the conditions outlined in the summary as noted by Chair Carter, Boardmember Banda seconded the motion.

Vote: 7-0

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Carter–Thomas–Banda–Posten-Thompson–Placko–Knudsen

NAYS – None

E. Adjournment

Boardmember Banda motioned to adjourn and Boardmember Placko seconded the motion.

Without objection, the meeting adjourned at 6:53pm.

Vote: 7-0

Upon tabulation of vote, it showed:

AYES – Carter–Thomas–Banda–Posten–Thompson–Placko–Knudsen

NAYS – None

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager’s Office at (480) 644- 3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644- 2767.**